



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/695,194	10/24/2000	Gary Anthony Jubb	M8540/248465	1647

23370 7590 01/08/2004
JOHN S. PRATT, ESQ
KILPATRICK STOCKTON, LLP
1100 PEACHTREE STREET
SUITE 2800
ATLANTA, GA 30309

EXAMINER

GROUP, KARL E

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

1755

DATE MAILED: 01/08/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Advisory Action

Application No.

09/695,194

Applicant(s)

JUBB ET AL.

Examiner

Karl E Group

Art Unit

1755

--The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --**THE REPLY FILED****FAILS TO PLACE THIS APPLICATION IN CONDITION FOR ALLOWANCE.**

Therefore, further action by the applicant is required to avoid abandonment of this application. A proper reply to a final rejection under 37 CFR 1.113 may only be either: (1) a timely filed amendment which places the application in condition for allowance; (2) a timely filed Notice of Appeal (with appeal fee); or (3) a timely filed Request for Continued Examination (RCE) in compliance with 37 CFR 1.114.

PERIOD FOR REPLY [check either a) or b)]

- a) ☐ The period for reply expires _____ months from the mailing date of the final rejection.
 b) ☐ The period for reply expires on: (1) the mailing date of this Advisory Action, or (2) the date set forth in the final rejection, whichever is later. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of the final rejection.
ONLY CHECK THIS BOX WHEN THE FIRST REPLY WAS FILED WITHIN TWO MONTHS OF THE FINAL REJECTION. See MPEP 706.07(f).

Extensions of time may be obtained under 37 CFR 1.136(a). The date on which the petition under 37 CFR 1.136(a) and the appropriate extension fee have been filed is the date for purposes of determining the period of extension and the corresponding amount of the fee. The appropriate extension fee under 37 CFR 1.17(a) is calculated from: (1) the expiration date of the shortened statutory period for reply originally set in the final Office action; or (2) as set forth in (b) above, if checked. Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of the final rejection, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

1. ☒ A Notice of Appeal was filed on 28 November 2003. Appellant's Brief must be filed within the period set forth in 37 CFR 1.192(a), or any extension thereof (37 CFR 1.191(d)), to avoid dismissal of the appeal.
2. ☐ The proposed amendment(s) will not be entered because:
- a) ☐ they raise new issues that would require further consideration and/or search (see NOTE below);
 - b) ☐ they raise the issue of new matter (see Note below);
 - c) ☐ they are not deemed to place the application in better form for appeal by materially reducing or simplifying the issues for appeal; and/or
 - d) ☐ they present additional claims without canceling a corresponding number of finally rejected claims.
- NOTE: _____
3. ☐ Applicant's reply has overcome the following rejection(s): _____.
4. ☐ Newly proposed or amended claim(s) _____ would be allowable if submitted in a separate, timely filed amendment canceling the non-allowable claim(s).
5. ☒ The a) ☐ affidavit, b) ☐ exhibit, or c) ☒ request for reconsideration has been considered but does NOT place the application in condition for allowance because: see attachment.
6. ☐ The affidavit or exhibit will NOT be considered because it is not directed SOLELY to issues which were newly raised by the Examiner in the final rejection.
7. ☐ For purposes of Appeal, the proposed amendment(s) a) ☐ will not be entered or b) ☐ will be entered and an explanation of how the new or amended claims would be rejected is provided below or appended.

The status of the claim(s) is (or will be) as follows:

Claim(s) allowed: none.

Claim(s) objected to: none.

Claim(s) rejected: 14-23.

Claim(s) withdrawn from consideration: none.

8. ☐ The drawing correction filed on _____ is a) ☐ approved or b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.
9. ☐ Note the attached Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s). _____.
10. ☐ Other: _____

Karl E Group
 Primary Examiner
 Art Unit: 1755

1. An appeal under 37 CFR 1.191 was filed in this application on 11-28-03.
Appellant's brief is due on 1-28-04 in accordance with 37 CFR 1.192(a).
2. Applicant's arguments filed 11-08-03 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.
3. Applicants should note:
 - a. Cycling at 1000°C and 1100°C does not provide support for temperatures such as 900°C and 1500°C.
 - b. A maximum service temperature and a cycling temperature are not equivalent.
 - c. A limitation requiring greater than a certain value requires support in the disclosure. It appears applicants agree there is not support for temperatures such as 1500°C however are claiming temperatures that include 1500°C.
 - d. The rejected claims do not require actually subjecting the article to any temperatures. The only active process step is "disposing".
 - e. Furthermore the claims require a maximum service temperature greater than 900°C, which also allows for service temperatures less than 900°C since this is a maximum value. The minimum service temperature may be 500°C.
 - f. The declaration does not provide any tangible evidence that the fibers of the prior art do in fact have different properties than those set forth in the claims, as well as the compositions taught in the prior art references fall squarely within the ranges set forth in the claims.
 - g. All rejections are maintained.

4. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Karl E Group whose telephone number is 571-272-1368. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F (6:30-4:00) First Friday Off.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Mark Bell can be reached on 571-272-1362. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is (703) 872-9306.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-0661.


Karl E Group
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 1755

Keg
1-5-04